



DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY

NAVAL SEA SYSTEMS COMMAND
1333 ISAAC HULL AVENUE
WASHINGTON NAVY YARD DC 20376

IN REPLY REFER TO

5750

Ser 333/238

NOV 27 2012

John M. Fowler, Executive Director
Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
1100 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 803
Washington, DC 20004

Dear Mr. Fowler:

**SUBJECT: ANNUAL REPORT ON THE PROGRAM COMMENT FOR THE
DISPOSITION OF HISTORIC VESSELS**

Per the requirements of the Program Comment for the Department of Navy for the Disposition of Historic Vessels (Program Comment), issued by the Advisory Council for Historic Preservation on 5 March 2010, the annual report is provided as enclosure (1).

If you have any questions, my point of contact is Mr. James Poles, NAVSEA PMS 333, Navy Inactive Ships Program, (202) 781-0149 or james.poles@navy.mil.

Sincerely,

C. R. Pietras
CAPT USN
Program Manager
Navy Inactive Ships Program (PMS 333)

Enclosure: 1. Annual Report on the Program Comment for the Disposition of Historic Vessels

Copy to: Nancy Schamu, Executive Director, National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers

**Annual Report to the
Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
and the
National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers
on the
Program Comment for the Department of the Navy
for the Disposition of Historic Vessels**

Prepared by:

Naval Sea Systems Command
with the
Naval History and Heritage Command

Washington, DC

1 November 2012

Annual Report on the Program Comment for the Disposition of Historic Vessels

I. Introduction

This is the third Annual Report to the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP) and the National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers (NCSHPO) as required by the Program Comment for the Department of the Navy for the Disposition of Historic Vessels (hereinafter “the Program Comment”). The Program Comment was initiated by the Naval Sea Systems Command as an alternative method for the way in which the Navy will comply with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) with regard to the determination of National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) eligibility of its vessels and the treatment of adverse effects that may result from their disposition. The Program Comment was approved and issued by the ACHP effective 5 March 2010 and published in the *Federal Register*, Vol. 75, No. 49 on 15 March 2010.

For a property to be eligible for listing in the NRHP, it must meet one or more of the five evaluation criteria established by the Secretary of the Interior. The Program Comment provides guidance for applying these evaluation criteria to the Navy’s vessels, including active and inactive (decommissioned) vessels, which have unique characteristics compared to many other types of property assessed under the NHPA. In accordance with the Program Comment, U.S. Navy vessels are evaluated using these five characteristics:

- i. The vessel was awarded an individual Presidential Unit Citation. (A Presidential Unit Citation is awarded to military units that have performed an extremely meritorious or heroic act, usually in the face of an armed enemy.)
- ii. An individual act of heroism took place aboard the vessel such that an individual was subsequently awarded the Medal of Honor or the Navy Cross. (The Medal of Honor is awarded for valor in action against an enemy force. The Navy Cross is awarded for extraordinary heroism in action not justifying an award of the Medal of Honor.)
- iii. A President of the United States was assigned to the vessel during his or her naval service.
- iv. The vessel was the first to incorporate engineering, weapons systems, or other upgrades that represent a revolutionary change in naval design or warfighting capabilities, or other historic or socially significant event occurred on the vessel.
- v. Some other historic or socially significant event occurred on the vessel.

Qualified Navy Historians with knowledge about Navy vessels review active and inactive vessels to determine which meet one or more of the five evaluation characteristics stated above.

According to National Register Bulletin titled “*How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation*,” issued by the U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, a property shall not only be significant under the National Register criteria, but it also must retain integrity.

The National Register Bulletin states:

“The evaluation of integrity is sometimes a subjective judgment, but it must always be grounded in an understanding of a property's physical features and how they relate to its significance.

Historic properties either retain integrity (this is, convey their significance) or they do not. Within the concept of integrity, the National Register criteria recognize seven aspects or qualities that, in various combinations, define integrity.

To retain historic integrity a property will always possess several, and usually most, of the aspects. The retention of specific aspects of integrity is paramount for a property to convey its significance. Determining which of these aspects are most important to a particular property requires knowing why, where, and when the property is significant”.

The bulletin defines seven aspects of integrity that require evaluation to determine integrity. They are location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. For any vessel that meets one or more of the five Program Comment Evaluation Characteristics stated above, the same qualified Navy historians then determine whether that vessel continues to possess integrity applying the seven aspects of Integrity as described in the bulletin.

In accordance with the Program Comment, if the Navy determines that a vessel satisfies one or more of the five characteristics above, and possesses integrity such that the vessel looks much like it did when it was built or during the period for which it is considered historically significant, then the vessel is eligible for listing in the NRHP. For inactive vessels, the Navy documents its findings with a Determination of Eligibility (DoE) or a Determination of Ineligibility (DoI) statement after decommissioning but prior to vessel disposal. DoE's and DoI's are subject to participation by historic preservation stakeholders in accordance with Section III.C of the Program Comment. For active vessels, any DoE is preliminary until the vessel has been decommissioned, unless the vessel is planned to be a hot-ship Foreign Military Sale transfer on the same day it is decommissioned from U.S. Navy active service.

II. Report Requirements

In accordance with Section V of the Program Comment, the Navy will submit an annual report to the NCSHPO and the ACHP on the progress of the Program Comment on 1 December, annually. The Program Comment requires that the annual report include the following information:

- 1) The names and status of active vessels identified as eligible for listing in the NRHP, and the basis for their eligibility. See Table 1.

- 2) The names and status of decommissioned vessels identified as eligible for listing in the NRHP, and a copy of the statement of eligibility. See Table 2.
- 3) The names and status of decommissioned vessels identified as ineligible for listing in the NRHP, and a copy of the statement of ineligibility. See Table 3.
- 4) The names of the vessels eligible for listing in the NRHP whose final disposition occurred during the reporting period. See Table 4.

III. NHPA Eligibility Determinations

Tables 1 through 4 identify vessels and the completed NHPA eligibility determinations made for these vessels from the previous report through the cutoff date for information contained in this report, 1 November 2012. Copies of the DoE or DoI final determinations for inactive vessels listed in this report are publicly accessible at www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/Inactiveships/Historic/Completed_Evaluations.aspx.

Table 1: Active Vessels Identified as Eligible for Listing in the NRHP

Hull Number	Vessel Name	Vessel Status	Applicable Characteristic(s) (i, ii, iii, iv, v)
CVN-65	ENTERPRISE	Active; scheduled for decommissioning 1 December 2012	ii. LCDR Eugene B. McDaniel, CDR Peter W. Sherman, CDR Jerrold M. Zacharias, LCDR Michael L. Hall, CDR Glenn E. Kollman, and LT John G. Griffith, each flew from the ENTERPRISE during the Vietnam War and were awarded the Navy Cross for heroism. iv. ENTERPRISE was first nuclear-powered aircraft carrier in the world. v. ENTERPRISE's half-century record of operational service is presumably historic in itself.

Status of participation by historic preservation stakeholders for vessels identified in Table 1 (Program Comment Section III.C):

- ENTERPRISE (CVN-65): The DOE was provided to the NCSHPO, Historic Naval Ships Association (HNSA), and the USS Enterprise Association by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/072 of 16 May 2012. The DOE was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 11 July 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.

Several active ships were identified as having the potential to be considered for listing in the NRHP; however, none of these evaluations were finalized by 1 November 2012. These will be addressed in the next annual report.

Table 2: Inactive Vessels Identified as Eligible for Listing in the National Register of Historic Places

None.

Table 3: Inactive Vessels Identified as Ineligible for Listing in the National Register of Historic Places

Hull Number	Vessel Name	Vessel Status
MHC-51	OSPREY	Stricken, to be disposed of by GSA sale
MHC-54	ROBIN	Stricken, to be disposed of by GSA sale
MHC-56	KINGFISHER	Stricken, to be disposed of by GSA sale
MHC-57	CORMORANT	Stricken, to be disposed of by GSA sale
MHC-58	BLACK HAWK	Stricken, to be disposed of by GSA sale
MHC-62	SHRIKE	Stricken, to be disposed of by GSA sale
T-AE-26	KILAUEA	Stricken, sunk during multi-national sinking exercise (SINKEX) in the Pacific Ocean on 22 July 2012
T-AE-33	SHASTA	Stricken, to be disposed of by dismantling
T-AGS-51	JOHN McDONNELL	Stricken, potential FMS sale to Mexico

Status of participation by historic preservation stakeholders for vessels identified in Table 3 (Program Comment Section III.C):

- Ex-OSPREY (MHC-51): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, Historic Naval Ships Association (HNSA), and the Navy MSO Association, Inc., by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/032 of 5 March 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 29 May 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
- Ex-ROBIN (MHC-54): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, and the Navy MSO Association, Inc., by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/032 of 5 March 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 29 May 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
- Ex-KINGFISHER (MHC-56): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, and the Navy MSO Association, Inc., by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/032 of 5 March 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a

- 60-day public comment period that expired on 29 May 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
- Ex-CORMORANT (MHC-57): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, and the Navy MSO Association, Inc, by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/032 of 5 March 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 29 May 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
 - Ex-BLACK HAWK (MHC-58): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, and the Navy MSO Association by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/032 of 5 March 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 29 May 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
 - Ex-SHRIKE (MHC-62): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, and the Navy MSO Association by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/259 of 5 March 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 29 May 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
 - Ex-KILAUEA (T-AE-26): Ex-KILAUEA was designated for SINKEX by the Chief of Naval Operations on 17 April 2012, and was sunk 63 nautical miles from Hawaii in a water depth of 15,480 feet on 22 July 2012. The DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 11 July 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
 - Ex-SHASTA (T-AE-33): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, and HNSA by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/058 on 16 April 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 14 June 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
 - Ex-JOHN McDONNELL (T-AGS-51): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO and HNSA, and the National Association of Destroyer Veterans (NADV) by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/072 of 16 May 2012. Further, the DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 11 July 2012. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.

Table 4: Vessels Eligible for listing in the NRHP Whose Final Disposition Occurred during the Reporting Period

Hull Number	Vessel Name	Vessel Status
BB-61	IOWA	Determination of Eligibility dated 10 November 2011. Officially donated to the Pacific Battleship Center for use as a museum on 30 April 2012
DD-946	EDSON	Ex- EDSON was recognized as a National Historic Landmark 21 June 1990, prior to issuance of the Program Comment. Ex-

		EDSON was officially donated to the Saginaw Valley Naval Ship Museum on 24 April 2012
MSB-5	VOSELLER	On 12 December 2011, the Pate Museum of Transportation reported that it had completed the dismantling of the ex-VOSELLER wooden minesweeper in Fort Worth, TX. This was the first vessel donated as a ship museum to be scrapped at the end of its useful life as a museum. In August 2011, after eleven months of consultation with the Texas State Historic Preservation Officer, PMS 333 concurred with the Museum's plan to dismantle the vessel.
IX-529	SEA SHADOW	Determination of Eligibility 5 July 2011. Disposed of, along with ex-HUGHES MINING BARGE (HMB-1), via GSA sale to a private vendor. Dismantling in progress, completion of dismantling expected 30 November 2012.
SSN-688	LOS ANGELES	Determination of Eligibility 5 July 2011. Dismantling completed in 2012.

Status of participation by historic preservation stakeholders for vessels identified in Table 4 (Program Comment Section III.C):

- Ex-IOWA (BB-61): The DOE was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, NADV, the IOWA Veterans Association, Pacific Battleship Center, Historic Ships Memorial at Pacific Square, et al., by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/237 of 3 August 2011. The DOE was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 03 October 2011. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.
- Ex-EDSON (DD 946): On 21 January 1990, the National Park Service designated ex-EDSON as National Historic Landmark. As such, this ship was not subject to the requirement under the Program Comment to develop a Determination of Eligibility and to solicit public comment. The National Park Service Form 10-900 nominating EDSON to be listed on the NRHP was prepared by James P. Delgado, National Park Service, 8 January 1990. See <http://pdfhost.focus.nps.gov/docs/NHLS/Text/90000333.pdf>.
- Ex-VOSELLER (MSB-5). A qualified Navy historian at the Naval History and Heritage Command conducted a review of the historical significance of ex-VOSELLER and determined that the vessel was eligible for listing in the NRHP. To respond to a request to demolish the vessel by the Pate Museum, its owner, the Navy, in accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act, requested consultation with the Texas Historical Commission and solicited public input on the potential dismantling of the vessel. The Navy did not receive any reply from the public. It was decided that the vessel's deteriorated condition represented a loss of integrity such that it was no longer eligible for

listing in the National Register of Historic Places. On July 20, 2011, the TX SHPO provided its final concurrence with the disposal of the vessel. On August 17, 2011, the Naval Sea Systems Command provided its consent to proceed with the dismantling.

- Ex-SEA SHADOW (IX 529)/Hughes Mining Barge (HMB-1): HMB-1 was never listed in the Naval Vessel Registry, and both vessels were non-commissioned service craft, and therefore not subject to the Program Comment. However, this two-vessel combination was initially evaluated as potentially eligible for listing in the NRHP by a qualified Navy Historian in 2011 due to the combined system's adaptation of a stealth technology. No public input on the historic eligibility determination was solicited.
- Ex-LOS ANGELES (SSN-68): The DOI was provided to the NCSHPO, HNSA, Submarine Museums, and the Naval Submarine League by NAVSEA PMS 333 letter SER 333/040 of 7 March 2011. The DOI was posted to www.navsea.navy.mil/teamships/inactiveships/historic for a 60-day public comment period that expired on 7 May 2011. No comments were received by any stakeholder or member of the public.